

DERWENT VALLEY MILLS WORLD HERITAGE SITE

Shand House, Dale Road South, Darley Dale, Matlock, Derbyshire, DE4 3RY

T: +44(0) 1629 536831

E: info@derwentvalleymills.org

www.derwentvalleymills.org



Heather Wynne
Amber Valley Borough Council
Town Hall
Ripley
Derbyshire DE5 3BT

23rd October 2019

Dear Heather

AVA/2019/0889: Extension to form entrance hallway and porch on ground floor and bathroom on first floor; new window on front elevation; roof-lights and dormer window in the roof at Hill Top, Makeney Road, Makeney.

Please find below my response to the consultation concerning the above application. These comments will be taken to the World Heritage Site Conservation and Planning Panel for verification in November.

The site lies within the Derwent Valley Mills World Heritage Site (DVMWHS) Buffer Zone. The Derwent Valley Mills were inscribed on the World Heritage List by UNESCO in 2001. The Derwent Valley Mills Partnership, on behalf of HM Government, is pledged to conserve the unique and important cultural landscape of the Derwent Valley Mills World Heritage Site; to protect its outstanding universal value (OUV), to interpret and promote its assets; and to enhance its character, appearance and economic well-being in a sustainable manner.

The retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (SOUV) for the Derwent Valley Mills was adopted by the World Heritage Committee in 2010. The SOUV refers to the following UNESCO criteria, which the World Heritage Committee agreed were met at the time of inscription. They are:

- C(ii) That the site exhibits “an important interchange of human values, over a span of time or within a cultural area of the world, on developments in architecture or technology, monumental arts, town planning or landscape design”;
- C(iv) That the site is “an outstanding example of a type of building or architectural or technological ensemble or landscape, which illustrates a significant stage in human history”.

The SOUV records that these criteria were met for the following reasons:

- C(ii) The Derwent Valley saw the birth of the factory system, when new types of building were erected to house the new technology for spinning cotton developed by Richard Arkwright in the late 18th century.

C(iv) In the Derwent Valley for the first time there was large-scale industrial production in a hitherto rural landscape. The need to provide housing and other facilities for workers and managers resulted in the creation of the first modern industrial settlements.

A Management Plan for the World Heritage Site was created in 2002, and updated in 2014. It has as the first of its nine aims to: “protect, conserve and enhance the Outstanding Universal Value of the DVMWHS.” In accordance with this aim, and with reference to Section 12.1 of the Management Plan, I have consulted with Derbyshire County Council’s Conservation, Heritage and Design Service (which advises the World Heritage Site Partnership in planning matters), and have received the following advice:

This site is located within the Buffer Zone, which is designated to protect the ‘immediate’ setting of the Site. It is immediately adjacent to the World Heritage Site and the Belper and Milford Conservation Area. Hill Top is a large, unlisted stone built house, set within a rural landscape, above Duffield Bank. Although the building sits adjacent to the enclosed field pattern, the house is screened by trees and some distance from public views from roads or footpaths.

However, this property was built by the Strutt family who owned the mills at Milford and Belper, and was their final residence before they moved away from this area. As such, it shows a reduction in status from the larger, earlier, homes of Makeney Hall and Bridge Hill House, and is, therefore, an ‘Attribute’ of the World Heritage Site.

The application relates to a number of alterations and extensions to the interior and exterior of the dwelling. These would be in addition to other relatively modern extensions, including a conservatory and garage block, neither of which enhance the appearance of the dwelling. In view of the significance of the building, the proposed changes are relatively extensive, with the radical internal alterations extending to the exterior appearance. In particular, numerous changes are focussed on the northern elevation, at the access to the property, where its subservient service character would be raised in status as a result of the changes. Cumulatively, it is considered the proposals would cause further damage to the integrity of the design and composition of the residence for the following reasons:

- the proposed entrance structure would be an inappropriate feature to this ancillary end of the house; its assertive, double apex roof design, comprising rendered walls, a unconvincing oak-framed porch and full-height glazed openings would present a stark contrast in character to the simple, domestic character of the back entrance;
- the addition of a pitched roof to the two storey, flat-roofed service block (possibly not an original element), would contribute to raising the status of this ancillary side of the house;
- the quantity of proposed new openings is numerous, and would significantly alter the original compositional proportion of solid to void; the large, full-height glazed opening to the kitchen would significantly alter the original design composition created by the ground- and first-floor mullioned windows;

- the dormer window would make no reference to its context, with awkwardly proportioned windows and a boarded gable;
- a significant number of rooflights would be inserted to interrupt the simplicity of the roof plane; the rooflights are the elements most likely to impact on longer views to the otherwise recessive roof planes, were they to be visible.

It is considered that the significance of the World Heritage Site would be harmed as the works would negatively impact on the authenticity and integrity of an Attribute that contributes to its Outstanding Universal Value. The harm is assessed to be 'less than substantial' as defined by the NPPF, although the conservation of designated heritage assets of the highest value would carry great weight against the public benefit of the proposal.

I hope these comments can be considered when a decision is made concerning this development.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Adrian Farmer". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Adrian Farmer

Heritage Co-ordinator, Derwent Valley Mills World Heritage Site.
cc Sarah Brooks, AVBC